



**BEFORE THE DISCIPLINARY COMMITTEE OF PAKISTAN MEDICAL COMMISSION**

In the matter of

Complaint No. PF.8-1641/2018-Legal

Wajahat Ahmad Ghous vs. Dr. Muhammad Haroon and others

Mr. Ali Raza	Chairman
Dr. Anis-ur- Rehman	Member
Dr. Asif Loya	Member

*Present:*

Wajahat Ahmad Ghous	Complainant
Hearing dated	10-12-2021

**I. FACTUAL BACKGROUND**

**Complaint**

1. Mr. Wajahat Ahmed Ghous (hereinafter referred to as the “Complainant”) filed a complaint before the Disciplinary Committee of erstwhile PM&DC on 15.05.2018 against Dr. Haroon (Respondent No.1), Dr. Khadeeja (Respondent No.2), Dr. Sara (Respondent No.3) and Dr.

Aqsa Aleem (Respondent No.4) working at Maroof International Hospital, Islamabad. Brief facts of the complaint are that:

- a. The complainant was taken to Maroof International Hospital, Islamabad on 26.04.2018 where he was admitted by consultant Dr. Haroon (Respondent no. 1) for platelet transfusion. The complainant alleged that during his stay in the hospital he remained un-attended and the tests advised to him were unnecessary and a very expensive CSF (colony stimulating factor) drug was advised to him prescription whereof was signed by the Medical Officer rather than the consultant himself.
- b. It has been alleged that Dr. Haroon (Respondent no. 1) is not a qualified consultant and the said doctor after examining him in emergency at 09:00 pm went home leaving him at the mercy of in-experienced medical officer.
- c. It has been further alleged that Dr. Sara (Respondent no. 3) gave a transfusion request to the complainant at 03:00am without mentioning the required number of units of platelets. When complained about the error, she misbehaved and refused to provide further treatment to the complainant.
- d. Subsequently, on 27.04.2018, Dr. Aqsa (Respondent no. 4) gave platelets transfusion request and again number of required units of platelets was not mentioned. Furthermore, Dr. Khadija (Respondent no.2) Medical Superintendent was approached for redressal of grievance but she pressurized the complainant.
- e. The complainant requested to take strict action against the Respondents

## II. NOTICES TO RESPONDENTS

2. Notices dated 29.06.2018 were issued to Dr. Muhammad Haroon (Respondent no. 1), Dr. Khadija (Respondent no. 2), Dr. Sara (Respondent no. 3), and Dr. Aqsa (Respondent no. 4) directing them to submit reply to the complaint.

## III. REPLY OF RESPONDENTS

3. In response to Notice, Dr. Uzma Qazi (wife of Respondent No. 1) on 16.07.2018 forwarded some documents pertaining to enquiry conducted by District Health Officer, Islamabad on complaint of Mr. Wajahat Ghaus. Later on, Dr. Muhammad Haroon submitted his reply to complaint on 30.07.2018 wherein he stated that:

- a. I am sorry for the advantage I have taken to practice as consultant before registration with PM&DC. Although, I have recently passed my exam from CPSP in general medicine. However, convocation of CPSP is pending.
  - b. The patient Wajahat 20 years old boy presented in emergency department with fever and low platelet counts on 26.04.2018. He stayed overnight & left against medical advice without completion of therapy on 27.04.2018. All the charges leveled in complaint are denied.
  - c. I am qualified enough & have experience of 13 years after completion of basic medical qualification. I have treated thousands of such patients. It was not a complicated case. Just a straight forward case of low platelets.
  - d. He had very low platelets 13000/ul (normal range; 150,000-450,000). I instructed the duty doctors to take good care of him.
  - e. Throughout his stay in the hospital, he & his male friends who were his attendants misbehaved & harassed young lady doctors on duty. The night administrator of Maroof hospital dealt with him multiple times and tried to satisfy him but he was adamant that lady doctors should attend him whenever he rings the bell. He was shouting at the top of his voice all the time and created nuisance and a lot of disturbance in the hospital throughout his stay. The patient repeatedly demanded sleeping pills from the duty doctors but he was refused as sleeping pills were not appropriate for him and not indicated in his disease.
  - f. Each and every test ordered was clinically indicated & best treatment was given to him. My notes are written on the file. I wrote his diagnosis as thrombocytopenia which is not symptom. Thrombocytopenia is a medical term meaning “abnormally low platelets <150,000/ul”.
  - g. However, one shortcoming on our part during his treatment was that the duty medical officer did not write the correct number of platelet units on blood transfusion request form and for that his attendant had to come back again to get it revised from the duty doctor. Apart from that there was no medical or ethical breach or shortcoming in his management throughout his stay at the hospital.
  - h. I myself did not charge him a single rupee although I checked him in detail two times during his short stay of 15 hours in the hospital. All the allegations of overcharging are fake. His family physician, Dr. Bilal also works at PIMS & Maroof hospital and I waived off my consultation charges as Dr. Bilal is an old friend and junior of mine. The total bill taken by hospital including his room charges, investigation & medicines was Rs. 18000/- (eighteen thousand rupees).
4. Dr. Khadija (Respondent No. 2), Dr. Sara Hussain (Respondent No.3), Dr. Aqsa Aleem (Respondent No.4) also submitted their replies which are part of the record.

#### IV. REJOINDER BY COMPLAINANT

5. Reply/comments submitted by respondents were shared with the complainant for rejoinder. The complainant submitted his rejoinder on 13.11.2018 wherein he reiterated contents of his complaint. He further stated that allegations of harassment of lady doctor by his attendant are fabricated. Dr. Haroon approached him and offered money to withdraw the complaint.

#### V. PROCEEDINGS BY DISCIPLINARY COMMITTEE OF ERSTWHILE PMDC

##### 1<sup>st</sup> Hearing

6. After completion of codal formalities case was placed before the Disciplinary Committee of PMDC for hearing on 30.03.2019. The Committee observed that

“Doctor writes intensive care physician on the basis of a post graduate qualification of MS from PIMS which was not registered with PMDC as additional qualification in his respect. Dr. Haroon, the treating physician claiming to be an intensivist had been advertising false credential admitted the patient assuring him that he will be managed. Dr. Haroon is guilty of fraudulent misrepresentation and neglect”.

7. The Disciplinary Committee recommended as under:-

*It was agreed that Dr. Aqsa, Dr. Sara and Dr. Khadija be exonerated.*

*Furthermore, notices be issued to MS, Maroof International Hospital, Islamabad and to Dr. Haroon to explain the following:*

- 1. Dr. Haroon was registered only as an MBBS and he cannot pose as an intensive specialist so how did Maroof International Hospital hired him as intensive specialist without registration of his additional qualification.*
- 2. Why was assurance given to the patient when Maroof Intl. Hospital did not have the required facility in their blood bank.*

##### Notice in compliance of Disciplinary Committee directions

7. In view of recommendations of Disciplinary Committee dated 30.03.2019, notices dated 10.05.2019 were issued to Medical Superintendent of Maroof International Hospital, Islamabad



and Dr. Haroon directing them to submit their explanation. Reminder dated 12.09.2019 was also sent to Medical Superintendent, Maroof International Hospital and Dr. Haroon separately.

### **Reply of Maroof International Hospital, Islamabad**

8. Manager of Maroof International Hospital in response to notice dated 10.05.2019 submitted his reply/comments on 02.10.2019, wherein it was stated that:
  - a. Dr. Muhammad Haroon was included in the panel of doctors by Maroof International Hospital as a medical specialist and intensivist. Before joining the hospital, he provided copies of degrees of FCPS Medicine and MCCM (Master of Critical Care Medicine) SZABMU, PIMS. He promised to provide valid PMDC registration certificate having both degrees duly registered with in few weeks time.
  - b. However, on repeated reminders he failed to provide the required PMDC registration certificates and suspecting the credibility of his qualifications, formal letters were sent to respective institutions for verification of degrees.
  - c. Meanwhile his contract was terminated and all his privileges were withdrawn w.e.f 30.03.2019.
  - d. No assurance was provided to the patient in terms of arrangement of platelets. Maroof hospital only claimed that it will facilitate patient Wajahat with the transfusion, however when blood bank was asked to arrange platelets, it came to the notice that Maroof's blood bank is short of platelets at that time. This is a common practice in hospital settings and most of the time patient's attendants are requested to arrange for donors or blood products on their own. Patient's attendants were asked to arrange a mega unit of platelets as he had very low platelets number. The only mistake happened at our end was that concerned Medical Officer didn't write numbers of units required for which she apologized to the patient / complainant as well.

### **Reply of Dr. Muhammad Haroon**

9. Dr. Muhammad Haroon did not submit his explanation in response to notice dated 10.05.2019. Reminders dated 06.08.2019; 12.09.2019 and 04.10.2019 were also sent to him in this regard.

### **2<sup>nd</sup> Hearing**

10. The matter was again fixed for hearing before Disciplinary Committee of PMDC on 23.07.2020. Medical Superintendent of Maroof International Hospital and the Complainant appeared before

the Disciplinary Committee; however, Dr. Muhammad Haroon remained absent. The Committee observed and recommended as under:-

*“As the condition of the patient was deteriorating therefore he was kept admitted. No final diagnosis could be established as patient left without medical advice in the subsequent morning.*

*The blood group of the complainant was rare and the process of arranging from other hospital is a lengthy process and the arrangement of the same is responsibility of the patient/attendants however they were informed well in time by the hospital administration to ensure availability incase if needed.*

*The documents produced by Dr. Haroon were sufficient for his selection as specialist as he had produced attested copy of degree of FCPS medicine cleared from CPSP 2015. However due to the allegation of the complainant and the matter subjudice at Disciplinary Committee, Dr. Haroon was terminated from Maroof Hospital”*

*“Committee recommended that the degree of FCPS of Dr. Haroon will be verified from CPSP, upon verification of the degree, the case will be closed”.*

### **Verification in respect of Dr. Haroon**

11. In compliance of directions/recommendations of Disciplinary Committee dated 23.07.2020, a letter was sent on 15.09.2021 followed by reminder dated 24.09.2021 to the Controller of Examination, College of Physician and Surgeons Pakistan (CPSP) for verification of FCPS degree of Dr. Muhammad Haroon.

### **Response From CPSP, Karachi**

12. Chief Controller of Examinations, CPSP, Karachi vide letter dated 08.10.2021, informed that FCPS degree in Medicine, bearing serial No. 15637 in the name of Dr. Muhammad Haroon is fake. The Controller Examination further informed that *“Dr. Muhammad Haroon, PMDC No. 46284, was a registered trainee of CPSP, who failed 13 times in FCPS part II examination. He never passed FCPS examination nor issued FCPS degree.....He also prepared a prescription pad mentioning the FCPS qualification along with many others from the foreign countries. His matter was investigated by the College in detail on confirmation of willful act of forgery, the College Council cancelled his Registration as FCPS Part II trainee. Now he is not allowed to take any CPSP examination”.*

## **V. PROCEEDINGS BY THE DISCIPLINARY COMMITTEE OF PMC**

### **Hearing**

13. Matter was fixed for hearing before the Disciplinary Committee on 10.12.2021. Notice dated 29.11.2021 were issued to Complainant and Respondent Dr. Muhammad Haroon directing them

to appear before the Disciplinary Committee for hearing on 10.12.2021. The Complainant appeared before the Disciplinary Committee whereas Respondent Dr. Muhammad Haroon remained absent despite service of Notices through Courier services as well as at his email addresses [haroonoptimist@gmail.com](mailto:haroonoptimist@gmail.com) and [haroonoptimist@yahoo.com](mailto:haroonoptimist@yahoo.com).

14. The Complainant stated that during the previous hearing dated 30.03.2019 allegation to the extent of medical negligence of Dr. Muhammad Haroon stood established. He further stated that he had also filed a complaint before Consumer Court for compensation, which was dismissed due to non-prosecution. He assailed decision of Consumer Court before the Honorable Islamabad High Court but his appeal was also dismissed. The matter is now pending before August Supreme Court of Pakistan.
15. The Complainant referred to observations made by the Disciplinary Committee of erstwhile PMDC in its meeting held on 30.03.2019 that Respondent Dr. Haroon was guilty of negligence. It was explained to him by the Committee that observation made by then Disciplinary Committee which has been relied upon by him did not refer to professional negligence in treatment of the patient rather it was limited to false representation made by him as to his credentials and post graduate qualification.

## VI. FINDINGS AND CONCLUSION

16. Disciplinary Committee at the very outset observed that the Respondent Dr. Muhammad Haroon remained absent despite service of notices through courier as well as electronic means i.e. through email at his given email addresses [haroonoptimist@gmail.com](mailto:haroonoptimist@gmail.com) and [haroonoptimist@yahoo.com](mailto:haroonoptimist@yahoo.com).
17. The Committee has perused the record which reveals that the complaint to the extent of Dr. Aqsa, Dr. Sara and Dr. Khadija had already been disposed of and they were exonerated during proceedings dated 30.03.2019. However, Respondent Dr. Muhammad Haroon and Medical Superintendent of Maroof International Hospital were asked to explain as to how Dr. Muhammad Haroon was working as intensivist while he was registered as simple MBBS with the



PM&DC. Relevant portion of minutes of Disciplinary Committee hearing are reproduced hereunder:

*“It was observed that the respondent (Dr. Haroon) writes intensive care physician on the basis of a postgraduate qualification of MS from PIMS which was not registered with PM&DC as additional qualification in his respect. Dr. Haroon, the treating physician claiming to be intensivist had been advertising false credentials admitted the patient assuring him that he will be managed.*

*It was agreed that Dr. Aqsa, Dr. Sara and Dr. Khadija be exonerated.*

*Furthermore, notices be issued to MS, Maroof International Hospital, Islamabad and to Dr. Haroon to explain the following:-*

*Dr. Haroon was registered only as an MBBS and he cannot pose as an intensive specialist so how did Maroof International Hospital hired him as intensive specialist without registration of his additional qualification.*

1. *Why was assurance given to the patient when Maroof Intl. Hospital did not have the required facility in their blood bank.*

18. The Committee further observes that Dr. Muhammad Haroon never submitted his explanation regarding his practice as intensivist despite notice dated 10.05.2019 and reminders dated 06.8.2019, 12.09.2019 and 04.10.2019. The Medical Superintendent of Maroof International Hospital, however in compliance to notice dated 10.05.2019 and 06.08.2019 submitted his version wherein he stated that Dr. Muhammad Haroon was included in the panel of doctors by Maroof International Hospital as medical specialist and intensivist. At the time of joining the hospital Dr. Haroon provided copies of degree of FCPS medicines and MCCM (Master of Critical Care Medicine). The Medical Superintendent along with his reply also submitted a copy of FCPS certificate bearing number 15637 in the name of Dr. Muhammad Haroon dated 10.06.2015.

19. The Maroof Hospital has submitted on record that the Respondent Dr. Haroon promised to provide valid PMDC registration certificate having both degrees duly registered with in few weeks' time. However, on repeated reminders he failed to provide the required PMDC registration certificates and suspecting the credibility of his qualifications, formal letters were



sent to respective institutions for verification of degrees. Meanwhile his contract was terminated and all his privileges were withdrawn w.e.f. 30.03.2019.

20. Perusal of record further reveals that after receiving response from Medical Superintendent the matter was again fixed for hearing before the Disciplinary Committee of erstwhile PMDC on 23.07.2020 whereby the Disciplinary Committee recommended that the degree of FCPS of Dr. Haroon will be verified from CPSP. A Copy of FCPS certificate bearing number 15637 in the name of Dr. Muhammad Haroon dated 10.06.2015 was forwarded to Controller Examinations CPSP, for verification vide letter dated 15.09.2021. Chief Controller of Examinations, CPSP, Karachi vide letter dated 08.10.2021, informed that FCPS degree in Medicine, bearing serial No. 15637 in the name of Dr. Muhammad Haroon is a fake document. The Controller Examination further informed that Dr. Muhammad Haroon, PMDC No. 46284, was a registered trainee of CPSP, who failed 13 times in FCPS part II examination. He never passed FCPS examination nor issued FCPS degree. He also prepared a prescription pad mentioning the FCPS qualification along with many others from the foreign countries. His matter was investigated by the College in detail on confirmation of willful act of forgery, the College Council cancelled his Registration as FCPS Part II trainee. Now he is not allowed to take any CPSP examination.
21. The Disciplinary Committee observes that from the available documentary evidence it becomes manifestly clear that the Respondent Dr. Haroon has been working as consultant at Maroof International Hospital, based on a fake FCPS certificate presented by Dr. Haroon. Dr. Muhammad Haroon also made false statement in his reply submitted on 30.07.2018 wherein he stated that *"I have recently passed my exam from CPSP in general medicine. However, convocation of CPSP is pending."* This statement of Dr. Muhammad Haroon is false since the Controller examination CPSP in his letter dated 08.10.2021 has clearly mentioned that *"Dr. Muhammad Haroon, PMDC No. 46284, was a registered trainee of CPSP, who failed 13 times in FCPS part II examination. He never passed FCPS examination nor issued FCPS degree."* The fraud sought to be committed by Dr. Haroon amounts to falsely acquiring recognition of a non-existent postgraduate qualification which would entitle him to represent, again falsely, to patients that he was qualified to treat them as a medical specialist and intensivist

22. The Disciplinary Committee notes that on the letter head of Maroof International Hospital, name of Dr. Haroon is displayed as “Dr. Muhammad Haroon, FCPS, MCPS, MCCM, which is misrepresentation as to the qualification. It is important to note here that in terms of section 29 (2) of the Pakistan Medical Commission Act, 2020 no practitioner shall represent himself as a specialist or practice as specialist, without having appropriate qualification, recognized and duly registered by the Commission. Section 29 (2) & 13 are reproduced as under:

**Section 29 – Licensing**

*(2) “A general practitioner may treat all ordinarily recognized common medical or dental ailments and shall not practice in fields or specialties, as recognized by the Commission for which formal training is required subject to any restrictions prescribed by the Council. In life saving emergencies treatment may be provided until ordinarily recognized specialist services can be obtained or a safe referral can be ensured. No practitioner shall represent himself as a specialist or practice as a specialist, without having appropriate qualifications, recognized and duly registered by the Commission.”*

*(13) No registered licensee shall use or publish in any manner whatsoever any title, description or symbol indicating or intended to lead persons to infer that he possesses any additional or other professional qualification unless the same has been duly recognized and registered on his licence by the Commission.*

20. The Committee observes that conduct of Respondent Dr, Haroon represents not only a patent absence of his duty and obligation as a doctor to be truthful and honest and place his patients’ health and safety first and foremost but further admits to his absolute lack of integrity. In effect Dr. Hareoon falsely represented himself as qualified in a particular field when he had failed to acquire such qualification. The very intent of Dr. Haroon in this matter violates the most fundamental obligation imposed upon a medical practitioner when licensed and it is not only necessary but mandatory to protect the people of Pakistan from such practitioners lacking basic integrity and place their personal interests above and beyond the health and interests of the patient.

21. In view of forgoing, conduct of Respondent Dr. Haroon is against the norms of ethics and falls under category of major offences as provided in Regulation 13 (1) (a) of Pakistan Medical

Commission (Enforcement) Regulations, 2021. In view of the forgoing, on the basis of available record, the Disciplinary Committee imposes major penalty as prescribed under Regulation 13 (1) (a) (iii) and his license to practice bearing no. 46284-P stands cancelled permanently.

22. Further, under Section 34(4) of the Pakistan Medical Commission Act, 2020 whoever falsely pretends and uses with his name any title or words or letters representing that he is so registered with the Authority or uses the word "doctor" or any other nomenclature or designation without legal basis, irrespective of whether any person is actually deceived by such pretence or not, is guilty of an offence of misrepresentation. Section 34 (4) is reproduced in its relevant part:

#### **Section 34(4) PMC Act**

*Whoever falsely pretends to be registered under this Act as a medical practitioner or dentist and uses with his name any title or words or letters representing that he is so registered with the Authority or uses the word "doctor" or any other nomenclature or designation without legal basis, irrespective of whether any person is actually deceived by such pretence or representation or not, shall be guilty of an offence punishable with imprisonment for a term which may extend to three years or with fine which may extend to ten million Rupees but shall not be less than one million Rupees or with both.*

23. Abovementioned facts present a case of falsely representing a qualification fraudulently which is triable by the Medical Triable. Therefore, the case of Dr. Muhammad Haroon is referred to Medical Tribunal for further proceedings under the Medical Tribunal Act, 2020.
24. The Committee further observes that Maroof International Hospital, allowed Dr. Muhammad Haroon to practice as a medical specialist and intensivist without first verifying his credentials from the CPSP. On the letter head of Maroof International Hospital name of Dr. Haroon is displayed as "Dr. Muhammad Haroon, FCPS, MCPS, MCCM which amounts to maladministration on part of healthcare establishment as well.
25. The Maroof Hospital has submitted on record that the Respondent Dr. Haroon promised to provide valid PMDC registration certificate having both degrees duly registered with in few weeks time. Therefore, the hospital was aware at the time of hiring Dr. Haroon and representing

him to their patients as qualified that his qualification had not been provided. However, despite his failure to produce the requisite documents the hospital allowed him to continue practice as a consultants/intensivist. It was only when disciplinary action was initiated by the Disciplinary Committee that the hospital wrote letter to CPSP for verification of his degree.

26. In view of forgoing, the case of Maroof International Hospital, Islamabad is therefore referred to Islamabad Healthcare Regulatory Authority for further necessary action in accordance with law.

Dr. Anis-ur- Rehman  
Member

Dr. Asif Loya  
Member

Muhammad Ali Raza  
Chairman

26 January, 2022